

SECURITY NEXUS

A free, open access, international, peer-reviewed, online publication for the Daniel K. Inouye Asia-Pacific Center for Security Studies faculty and alumni.

Security Nexus Perspectives

MAKING THE MOST OF IT, PART II: XI JINPING LEVERAGES CORONAVIRUS "WAR WITHOUT SMOKE" TO SPUR DIGITAL TRANSFORMATION, TEST NATIONAL DEFENSE MOBILIZATION

By Dr. David Dorman*

General Secretary Xi Jinping's exhortation to "turn danger into opportunity"¹ in the face of the coronavirus epidemic undergirds much of the Communist Party's current domestic propaganda that seeks to drive China's "economic restart."² The "opportunity" provided by the pandemic to accelerate construction of China's "new-type (digital) infrastructure,"³ which includes leveraging the coronavirus-driven global shift to 5G business and industrial platforms, has been one of the Party's economic and technological exemplars.⁴ But Xi's guidance on crisis management, in effect "making the most of it," was designed for wider application. The People's Liberation Army (PLA) seized Xi Jinping's guidance early, leveraging the unique crisis conditions it created, a "war without smoke,"⁵ to test and envision further modernization of military operations and activities ranging from peacetime defense mobilization and expanded military medical diplomacy⁶ to improvements in its ability to fight and win future informatized local wars.⁷

Despite being tied to the epidemic or "economic restart," current Chinese domestic propaganda efforts on topics ranging from "crisis management" to "digital transformation" and "defense mobilization" did not originate with the coronavirus. Instead, each represents an agile repackaging of Communist Party guidance and propaganda messaging that was already months or years old. Facing a crisis of confidence following its muddled response to the coronavirus outbreak, domestic propaganda efforts were initiated within days or weeks to remold the Party image. Instead of starting from scratch, existing campaigns were repackaged to highlight a Party that was not only in control and leading the crisis response, but even taking advantage of the crisis to accelerate China's domestic and international goals.

During his inspection tour of Zhejiang Province in late March 2020, Xi Jinping made the highly publicized statement that "danger and opportunity always coexist . . . seize and create opportunity from the crisis and the difficulty you face."⁸ Xi used the tour to spur the country's economic restart and this statement would become one of the Communist Party's hallmarks to encourage business and industry across China to see and create economic opportunities out of the epidemic. More broadly though, Xi described opportunities

^{*} Dr. Dorman is a professor at the Daniel K. Inouye Asia-Pacific Center for Security Studies (DKI APCSS) in Honolulu, USA. The views expressed in this article are the author's alone, and do not necessarily reflect the official position of the DKI APCSS or the United States Government.

created by the epidemic that were wider and more strategic, from the general acceleration of science and technology to the general optimization and upgrading of industry,⁹ all based on the heightened epidemicdriven imperative for China's across-the-board digital transformation.¹⁰ The roots of Xi's guidance and the ensuing propaganda campaign, however, preceded the Zhejiang tour by almost a year. At the time, the guidance was directed at a wide and senior audience of Communist Party leaders.

Xi laid out his vision for crisis management during two Party leadership meetings in January 2019, well timed for the public health crisis that had yet to materialize. The first was the "Central Conference on Political and Legal Work,"¹¹ followed by a "Provincial-Level Special Seminar for Leading Cadre,"¹² both held in Beijing during the second and third weeks of January. Xi spoke at each event where he highlighted his vision for preventing and mitigating major risk in a wide variety of circumstances including politics, ideology, economics, science and technology, (domestic) society, the external environment, and Party building.¹³ Although it did not receive much attention outside China, Xi's vision to "turn danger into opportunity" was first introduced here.

At these meetings, Xi admonished Party leaders to anticipate crises of all kinds before they happen, and when they do occur, his expectation was that these leaders will show creativity and initiative to find the opportunity inherent in the crisis.¹⁴ At the central conference, Xi called on Party leaders to have the "courage to act" and to "take the strategic initiative" to "change risk into safety" and "turn danger into opportunity."¹⁵ He would repeat a similar message at the provincial-level seminar but added the colorful metaphors of "black swans" and "gray rhinos" to illuminate his direction to Party leaders to maintain a high degree of vigilance,¹⁶ "gray rhinos" accurately describing the context for the epidemic that was still months away. When Beijing decided it was advantageous to shift blame to Party leaders in Hubei province and Wuhan city for the Communist Party's initial response to the coronavirus epidemic, Party commentary tied their mistakes to not applying Xi's January guidance on crisis management.¹⁷

Chinese military commentators found Xi's "dialectic logic" on "danger and opportunity" an apt template for grading the performance of the PLA during the early stages of the epidemic.¹⁸ One academic at the PLA National Defense University College of National Security Studies offered that the insights gained from the PLA's participation in epidemic prevention and control could be used to improve its ability to win future informatized local wars,¹⁹ a view repeated by other experts in the Chinese military.²⁰ Mirroring Xi Jinping's broader guidance to the Party, the same academic argued that the circumstances surrounding the epidemic are relevant to conditions China's military could face in future informatized local wars: sudden outbreak and rapid escalation, individual actions generating wide and unexpected outcomes, and the necessity to rapidly take the strategic initiative to turn the situation in your favor.

Military and civilian commentators alike highlighted that conditions like these pointed to the importance of a comprehensive digital economy and infrastructure, 5G-driven online platforms and ecosystems, and the high-technology innovation need to support both. This was not new language, much of it based on guidance from Xi Jinping years before.²¹ However, now it was repackaged to highlight a Communist Party that had seen and reacted quickly to global business opportunities opened by the pandemic, not anything like the Party that slept through the viral outbreak. Military commentators also jumped on the "opportunity" to highlight epidemic-driven insights. In addition to the continued importance of military-civilian fusion, experts pointed to the epidemic-driven recommendation that ongoing PLA high-technology programs like digitalization and intelligentization must continue.

One of the most widely covered aspects of PLA support to the epidemic fight was activation of China's National Defense Mobilization System, a wartime capability designed to synchronize the combat support functions and capabilities provided by China's regular military, armed police, reserves, and militia.²² Mobilization was a modernization priority of Xi Jinping's prior to the pandemic, and the coronavirus outbreak created an "opportunity" to test, in particular, the civilian-military coordination functions needed to support PLA requirements at the coronavirus "frontline." Reflecting the inherent organizational and institutional superiority of China's system, Xi Jinping viewed the mobilization system as a "magic weapon,"²³ a warfighting capability that China's potential adversaries do not and could not possess. Some of the "magic" was embedded in the system's bidirectional coordination mechanisms, processing both the expanding PLA requirements for the civilian economy and the corresponding civilian requirements for militia and reserve support to expanding industrial, agricultural and societal needs at the local level.

Activation was viewed as both a civic effort to support a public health crisis and a "training ground and whetstone" to test and improve the defense mobilization system for future warfare. Reserve and militia members were mobilized to fulfill wide-ranging requirements organized by five functional areas [political mobilization, science and technology mobilization, economic mobilization, People's Armed Forces mobilization, and the transportation readiness system].²⁴ Key tasks performed by militia and reservists included: supporting expanded production of medical equipment and supplies to answer widespread shortages,²⁵ assisting the families of military medical and logistic staff that had been forward deployed to Hubei province and Wuhan city,²⁶ aiding in agricultural planting and harvesting,²⁷ supporting epidemic control and prevention efforts inside community grids,²⁸ managing and coordinating communications between the "front line" in Hubei province and supporting rear areas,²⁹ and producing and distributing local propaganda materials to help guide public opinion regarding the epidemic.³⁰

Although domestic media generally glowed about reserve and militia contributions to fighting the pandemic, commentators and local commanders often provided a more balanced assessment, highlighting the capabilities inherent in the system but also the significant flaws that remained, each of these better exposed by the "war without smoke." One military commentator highlighted that defense mobilization and crisis management are two independent systems in China, but based on the insights from Wuhan, should be integrated in the future.³¹ Although the primary function of each is different, supporting combat versus handling emergencies, the processes and players often overlap. Integration would bring organizational and operational efficiencies, particularly if China faced another pandemic or an informatized local war in the future. Above all, future requirements for both systems, military and civilian, required China's continued drive for digitalization, intelligentization, and informatization.

One repeated recommendation to improve the mobilization system in the aftermath of Wuhan was to develop an e-commerce platform to support China's existing global distribution system. Under normal conditions or emergencies, it would improve the efficiency of China's operations. During wartime, it would provide a global capability to supplement China's military logistics system.³² Especially important, countries that maintained "strategic cooperative partnerships" with China would be expected to assist China's war effort with goods and supplies.³³ Other problems with the mobilization system were also identified, ranging from the need to train Party and government leaders on the mobilization system in advance to improving the functionality of command communications supporting defense mobilization.³⁴ Importantly though, what united nearly all the questions and answers is the common reference point used to frame them: The Communist Party's leadership in finding the "opportunity" to identify and solve the problem.

It is unlikely that the pandemic stressed or tested the defense mobilization system, or even parts of it, at the same level as war. Nor was the Party's propaganda approach regarding digitalization substantially different before or after the Wuhan lockdown. What differed was presentation. While lessons were certainly learned about mobilization, and infrastructure requirements may have been refined, the propaganda approach itself was mostly about the Party. Domestic news led with stories about the heroics of mobilization and the Party that led it. Citizens often heard about the "opportunity" the Party identified to assess the mobilization system. No one in China could miss the "opportunity" the Party identified to fill expanding global commerce requirements by accelerating the construction of digital infrastructure and online platforms. Tying the Party to the "opportunities" created by the epidemic and not the "danger" that produced them was and is the primary objective. The real crisis, Party governance at the coronavirus outbreak, is avoided.

The views expressed in this article are the author's alone, and do not necessarily reflect the official position of the DKI APCSS or the United States Government. April 2020

References

¹ The aphorism used by Xi Jinping, "转危为机," finds its origin in the view that the Chinese word for "crisis" is composed of elements representing "danger" and "opportunity." This view of the word's underlying composition has been challenged in the West, see for instance Palmer, J. What a Start-Ip Crash Reveals About China's Post-Coronavirus Economy. FP China Brief, 2020; Apr 08, <u>https://foreignpolicy.com/2020/04/08/start-up-crash-reveals-china-post-coronavirus-economy-luckin-coffee-fraud/</u> and Mair, V. How a misunderstanding about Chinese characters has led many astray. Pinyin.info, 2009; Sep, <u>http://www.pinyin.info/chinese/crisis.html</u>. For a recent Communist Party commentary on Xi Jinping's application of "Danger and Opportunity" to Party governance during the pandemic, see 在化危为机中赢得发展主动权(深入学习贯彻习近平新时代中国特色社会主义思想). 人民日报, 2020, Apr 16, <u>http://theory.people.com.cn/n1/2020/0416/c40531-31675439.html</u>

https://language.chinadaily.com.cn/a/202002/12/WS5e434c7ea310128217276d25.html and "每日一词 | 分区分级复工复产" region-specific and risk-based resumption of work and production. 中国日报网, 2020; Mar 23, http://language.chinadaily.com.cn/a/202003/23/WS5e781a1ca310128217281289.html

http://www.81.cn/gfbmap/content/2020-03/11/content_256074.htm

⁶ For an earlier analysis of this topic, see Dorman, D. Making the Most of It: China's Military Wins the COVID-19 Fight in Wuhan. Security Nexus, 2020; Apr 06, <u>https://apcss.org/nexus_articles/making-the-most-of-it-chinas-military-wins-the-covid-19-fight-in-wuhan/</u>. Since this was written, the PLA continues to expand its use of online teleconferences to engage

² Literally, "Resume work, resume production (复工复产)." For China Daily's recommended English-language translation of the term, see "每日一词 | 复工复产 work resumption." 中国日报网, 2020; Feb 12,

³"新型基础设施建设." For a comprehensive Ministry of Industry and Information Technology description of the 5G role in constructing China's "new type infrastructure," see 5G 领跑"新基建" 谁是"关键"的新型基础设施? 人民日报海外版, 2020; Mar 18, <u>http://it.people.com.cn/n1/2020/0318/c1009-31636991.html</u>. Jude Blanchette and Johnathan E. Hillman recently published an comprehensive analysis on the impact of the coronavirus epidemic on construction of China's 5G-based new-type infrastructure, see "China's Digital Silk Road after the Coronavirus." Center for Strategic & International Studies, 2020; Apr 13, <u>https://www.csis.org/analysis/chinas-digital-silk-road-after-coronavirus</u>

⁴ See for instance, 坚定必胜的中国信心: 新动能为中国经济发展注入更强动力. 经济日报, 2020; Apr 18, <u>http://economy.jschina.com.cn/jryw/202004/t20200418_2533478.shtml</u>

^{5&}quot;没有硝烟的战争." See for instance, 将战"疫"进行到底. 中国国防报, P1 2020; Mar 11,

foreign militaries on military medicine, parallel to similar efforts in China's civilian sector. See for instance, [Pakistan] "中国和巴基斯坦军队召开疫情防控经验分享视频会议." 人民日报 P2, 2020; Apr 8,

http://paper.people.com.cn/rmrb/html/2020-04/08/nw.D110000renmrb_20200408_7-02.htm and [Singapore] "中新军队召开 疫情防控经验分享视频会议." 人民日报, 2020; Apr 10 http://paper.people.com.cn/rmrb/html/2020-

04/10/nw.D110000renmrb_20200410_8-03.htm and [Russia] 召开新冠肺炎疫情防控经验分享视频会议. 解放军报, 2020 ; Apr 11, <u>http://www.81.cn/jfjbmap/content/2020-04/11/content_258650.htm</u>

⁷ See Joel Wuthnow's expert analysis of the PLA Joint Logistic Support Force mobilization to support China's national epidemic response and its Implications for Wartime Operations, "Responding to the Epidemic in Wuhan: Insights into Chinese Military Logistics." China Brief, 2020 Apr 13, <u>https://jamestown.org/program/responding-to-the-epidemic-in-wuhan-insights-into-chinese-military-logistics/</u>

⁸ Xi Jinping's complete statement was "危和机总是同生并存的,克服了危即是机。随着境外疫情加速扩散蔓延,国际 经贸活动受到严重影响,我国经济发展面临新的挑战,同时也给我国加快科技发展、推动产业优化升级带来新的机 遇。要深入分析,全面权衡,准确识变、科学应变、主动求变,善于从眼前的危机、眼前的困难中捕捉和创造机 遇." See,在化危为机中赢得发展主动权.人民日报,2020; Apr 16, <u>http://www.qstheory.cn/economy/2020-</u>04/17/c 1125871243.htm

⁹ See for instance, 习近平在浙江考察时强调 统筹推进疫情防控和经济社会发展工作 奋力实现今年经济社会发展目标 任务. 新华网, 2020; Apr 01, <u>http://www.xinhuanet.com/politics/leaders/2020-04/01/c 1125799612.htm</u>

¹⁰ See for instance, 在化危为机中赢得发展主动权. 人民日报, 2020; Apr 16, <u>http://www.qstheory.cn/economy/2020-04/17/c 1125871243.htm</u>

¹¹ Central Conference on Political and Legal Work (中央政法工作会议) held from January 15-16 in Beijing. See, 全面深 入做好新时代政法各项工作 促进社会公平正义保障人民安居乐业. 人民日报 P1, 2020; Jan 17, http://paper.people.com.cn/rmrb/html/2019-01/17/nw.D110000renmrb 20190117 2-01.htm

¹² Provincial-Level Special Seminar for Leading Cadre (省部级主要领导干部专题研讨班) held on January 21 in Beijing.

See, 提高防控能力着力防范化解重大风险-保持经济持续健康发展社会大局稳定. 人民日报 P1, 2020; Jan 22, <u>http://politics.people.com.cn/n1/2019/0122/c1001-30582726.html</u>

¹³ See for instance, 坚持底线思维, 增强忧患意识. 人民日报 P1, 2019; Jan 22,

http://paper.people.com.cn/rmrb/html/2019-01/22/nw.D110000renmrb_20190122_4-01.htm

¹⁴ H/T to Melanie Hart and Jordan Link for their excellent analysis of linkages between the coronavirus pandemic and Xi Jinping's earlier guidance on risk management at the Central Conference on Political and Legal Work. See, "Chinese President Xi Jinping's Philosophy on Risk Management." Center for American Progress, 2020; Feb 20, https://www.americanprogress.org/issues/security/news/2020/02/20/480680/chinese-president-xi-jinpings-philosophy-risk-

management/

¹⁵ "打好化险为夷、转危为机的战略主动仗." See for instance, "尹建业春节后首次调研,主要目的是:问计!" 江西 政法. 2019; Feb 14, https://jx.ifeng.com/a/20190214/7214668_0.shtml

¹⁶ See for instance, "习近平在中央政法工作会议上发表重要讲话等三则." 南方杂志, 2019; Jan 28, http://www.nfzz.net.cn/epaper/fb/297/content/2019-01/28/content_184987917.htm

¹⁷ See Dorman, D. "China's Global COVID-19 Assistance is Humanitarian and Geopolitical. That's Why People Are Worried." Security Nexus, 2020, Apr 14, <u>https://apcss.org/nexus_articles/chinas-global-covid-19-assistance-is-humanitarian-and-geopolitical-thats-why-people-are-worried/</u>

¹⁸ See for instance, 善于从危机中捕捉机遇. 解放军报, 2020; Apr 12, <u>http://www.qstheory.cn/llwx/2020-04/12/c_1125843619.htm</u>

¹⁹ 董文韬. 疫情防控对打赢未来信息化局部战争的启示. 光明日报, 2020: Apr 19, <u>https://tech.sina.com.cn/roll/2020-04-</u>19/doc-iirczymi7102494.shtml

²⁰ See, Dorman, D. Making the Most of It: China's Military Wins the COVID-19 Fight in Wuhan. Security Nexus, 2020; Apr 06, <u>https://apcss.org/nexus_articles/making-the-most-of-it-chinas-military-wins-the-covid-19-fight-in-wuhan/</u>

²¹ Most frequently, Xi Jinping's "4.19" speech at the 2016 Work Conference for Cybersecurity and Informatization is

highlighted for its continued relevance to technology-backed solutions to the coronavirus epidemic. See for instance, 战"疫"制胜, 习近平总书记为网信工作指方向. 中央广播电视总台央广网, 2020; Apr 16,

http://news.cnr.cn/dj/20200419/t20200419_525058782.shtml

²² For a comprehensive explanation and analysis of China's Defense Mobilization System, see Cheng, D. "Converting the Potential to the Actual: Chinese Mobilization Policies and Planning" in Andrew Scobell, Arthur S. Ding, Phillip C. Saunders, and Scott W. Harold (ed.), The People's Liberation Army and contingency planning in China, National Defense University Press, 2015, https://ndupress.ndu.edu/Portals/68/Documents/Books/PLA-contingency/PLA-Contingency-Planning-China.pdf. For a more recent expert assessment of militia efforts during the pandemic, see Shin Kawashima. "China's Militia and the Battle Against COVID-19." The Diplomat, 2020; Apr 16, https://thediplomat.com/2020/04/chinas-militia-and-the-battle-against-covid-19/

²³ H/T to Elsa Kania for highlighting Xi Jinping's reference to the mobilization system as a "magic weapon." For an excellent summary of the national defense mobilization system, see Kania, E. "Testimony before the National Commission on Service Hearing on 'Future Mobilization Needs of the Nation.'" Center for a New American Security, 2019; Apr 24, https://www.inspire2serve.gov/_api/files/200

²⁴ Air defense mobilization, one of the standard categories listed on The State Commission for National Defense Mobilization website, was not activated or not listed among references in Chinese domestic media. See for instance, 在战"疫"中凝聚前行力量. 中国国防报 P1, 2020; Mar 23, <u>http://www.81.cn/gfbmap/content/2020-03/23/content_257153.htm</u>

²⁵ See for instance, 抗疫不松劲 生产不停顿. 中国国防报 P1, 2020; Mar 03, <u>http://www.81.cn/gfbmap/content/2020-03/03/content_255354.htm</u>

²⁶ See for instance, 家事、急事、烦心事, 我们来解决. 中国国防报 P2, 2020; Mar 02,

http://www.81.cn/gfbmap/content/2020-03/02/content_255278.htm

²⁷ See for instance, 家事、急事、烦心事, 我们来解决. 中国国防报 P2, 2020; Mar 02,

http://www.81.cn/gfbmap/content/2020-03/02/content_255278.htm

²⁸ See for instance, 抗疫不松劲 生产不停顿. 中国国防报 P1, 2020; Mar 03, <u>http://www.81.cn/gfbmap/content/2020-03/03/content_255354.htm</u>

²⁹ See for instance, 疫情防控启示国防动员增效强能. 中国国防报 P3, 2020; Mar 20, http://www.81.cn/gfbmap/content/2020-03/20/content 256944.htm

³⁰ See for instance, 在战"疫"中凝聚前行力量. 中国国防报 P1, 2020; Mar 23, <u>http://www.81.cn/gfbmap/content/2020-03/23/content_257153.htm</u>

³¹ 董文韬. 疫情防控对打赢未来信息化局部战争的启示. 光明日报, 2020: Apr 19, <u>https://tech.sina.com.cn/roll/2020-04-</u>19/doc-iirczymi7102494.shtml

³² See for instance, 疫情防控启示国防动员增效强能. 中国国防报 P3, 2020; Mar 20,

http://www.81.cn/gfbmap/content/2020-03/20/content_256944.htm

³³ 沈岩, 廖锦标. 从疫情防控看潜力调查. 中国国防报 P3, 2020; Mar 13, <u>http://www.81.cn/gfbmap/content/2020-03/13/content_256254.htm</u>

³⁴ For one of the more comprehensive examinations of issues with the defense mobilization system during the epidemic response, see 疫情防控启示国防动员增效强能. 中国国防报 P3, 2020; Mar 20, <u>http://www.81.cn/gfbmap/content/2020-03/20/content_256944.htm</u>